

「新境界設定問題」は何を語っているのか

Liu Hanyi

広島大学 人間社会科学研究科

1. Background of New demarcation problem

1.1 demarcation problem

"Demarcation Problem" is a philosophical issue with a long history. According to Plato's dialogues, there has been a debate about the definition of trustworthy knowledge since the time of Socrates. Now, when we talk about demarcation issues, it usually means the issue that help us to distinguish between science and non-science or pseudo-science. Depending on the solution, we can roughly divide the demarcation problem into three phases. Logical positivism is the main claim of the first phase, and the second phase begins with Popper's falsifiability. The idea of the demise of the demarcation problem was put forward by Larry Laudan in 1983, but on the contrary, the issue of demarcation continued to be debated. In response to Laudan's argument, researchers suggests that we should shift our attention away from assessing the logic and verifiability of theories and towards false claims and wrongdoing (Pigliucci&Boudry, 2013). This renaissance led an era of multidisciplinary perspectives and multiple criteria for demarcation. And one of these perspectives is to rethink the relationship between science and values, to define good science and others by separating legitimate and illegitimate influences of values in science.

1.2 science and values

According to the three phase, the relationship between science and value also can be divided into three stages. The first is rationalist scientific theory, such as logical positivism and falsificationism up to the 1960s. Douglas (2009) calls the idea of overcoming the influence of external values to make science as truthful and objective as possible the Value free Ideal and argues that it's origins can be traced back to the Cold War. After this, science entered the second stage in the 1970s, which is represented by the theory of Social Constructionism. The second one broke out Value free Ideal and researchers began to generally accept the fact that science is full of values. With Alexandrova suggesting that scientific terminology itself has ethical and cultural implications, and Holman noting that external funding has a non-negligible impact on research activity. How to reconcile experts and knowledge, and reconstruct the trustworthy relationship between science and society became a central issue for the third stage which New Demarcation Problem

emerged in.

2. Emergence of the New demarcation problem

The realization that external values inevitably play a role in science led to the debate on the New Demarcation Problem. Holman&Wilholt described as following:

"We argue that attention should now be turned from debating the value-free ideal to delineating legitimate from illegitimate influences of values in science, a project we dub "The New Demarcation Problem".

Based on this premise against the value-free ideal, Holman&Wilholt's categorization of demarcation strategies excludes the view that values have no impact on scientific activity at all, and the view that the distinction between legitimate and illegitimate values can be made by a principled demarcation strategy. For the demarcation strategies of legitimate and illegitimate influences of values so far, Holman&Wilholt classified them into five categories, named 1. Axiological demarcation strategies, 2. Functionalist demarcation strategies, 3. Consequentialist demarcation strategies, 4. Coordinative demarcation strategies, and 5. Systemic strategies.

Bennett Holman, Torsten Wilholt (2022). The new demarcation problem, *Studies in History and Philosophy of Science*, Vol.91, 211-220.

Larry, L (1983). The Demise of the Demarcation Problem. In Robert S. Cohen & Larry Laudan (eds.), *Physics, Philosophy and Psychoanalysis: Essays in Honor of Adolf Grünbaum*. D. Reidel. pp. 111--127.

Pigliucci, M. and Boudry, M. (eds.) (2013) *The Philosophy of Pseudoscience: Reconsidering the Demarcation Problem*. University of Chicago Press.

Douglas, Heather (2009). *Science, Policy, and the Value-Free Ideal*. Pittsburgh, PA: University of Pittsburgh Press.

(講演時の使用言語：日本語)